

RECEIVED

OCT 10 2006

OFFICE OF THE SENATE

PROPOSAL TO THE SENATE COMMITTEE ON EDUCATIONAL POLICY

Realignment and Consolidation of Doctoral Degrees in Music Education

Sponsors

Chair, Division of Music Education: Professor Joe Grant (School of Music; phone 244-2669; email: joegrant@uiuc.edu)

Graduate Coordinator for Music Education: Professor Gary McPherson (School of Music; phone 333-8381; email: gem@uiuc.edu)

EP.07.15

(Rev. 11/13/06)

Brief Description

The University of Illinois currently offers two types of doctoral degrees for students specializing in music education: the Ed.D. (offered in the School of Music) and a Ph.D. (currently offered by the Department of Curriculum and Instruction, College of Education). This proposal seeks to move the administration and all academic aspects of the Ph.D. from the Department of Curriculum and Instruction (College of Education) into the School of Music (College of Fine and Applied Arts).

Justification

The prime reason for moving the administration of the Ph.D. to the School of Music is to allow it to more effectively compete with similar degrees offered internationally, and to encourage a larger proportion of music education doctoral students to undertake a research oriented degree (in comparison with the more practical approach of the existing Ed.D.). The proposal does not involve a restructuring of the degree except for the strengthening of the dissertation from the current minimum of 4 semester hours to a minimum of 16 semester hours (see table, Appendix A). The School of Music regards this proposal as a logical step in the evolution of an area that is crucial to the School of Music's future profile.

The impetus for moving the administration of the Ph.D. into the School of Music has come about as a result of a recent endowment in music education (which funds a full professor and graduate research student scholarship), an increasing awareness that leaders in future generations in the discipline of music education require a more tailored doctoral degree that includes a substantial research dissertation, and increased competition from neighboring institutions (as well as internationally). It is now clear that the current Ed.D. program offered by the School of Music, which has graduated many leaders here and abroad, must be complemented by a more research oriented degree that truly serves the needs of students who are interested in undertaking specialist research in music education, a discipline in which enormous advances in thinking and research have occurred during the past two decades. In addition, students who undertake specialized courses in music education typically do so within Schools of Music, and therefore would not normally complete their doctorate through a College of Education. Our review of PhD (music education) programs at other peer institutions and the most prominent music education programs in the States shows that PhD's are most often administered by the School of Music through their relevant graduate offices/colleges (i.e., Iowa, Indiana, Michigan, Michigan State, Minnesota, Ohio, Penn State, Texas, Florida, North Carolina,

Kansas, Case Western Reserve, Washington and Oregon). The norm both in North America and internationally is for the program authority for PhD's in music education to reside in the School of Music rather than a College of Education. With the exception of a PhD in Education (Music) offered by the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, we do not know of any PhD (Music Education) from a prominent university that is currently administered by a College of Education. (See Appendix B) Placing the administration of the Ph.D. (music education) in the School of Music will allow the School to more effectively promote the degree well into the future.

Currently, a professor in the Division of Music Education must serve as the academic advisor and dissertation chair of the Ph.D. in music education, as currently offered through the Department of Curriculum and Instruction. This is another reason why the Ph.D. would be more easily administered through the School of Music.

This proposal will have negligible impact on the Department of Curriculum and Instruction as students would continue to complete coursework from the College of Education, and there would still be opportunities for cross College involvement on dissertations. In fact, because of the research orientation of the Ph.D. in music education, CoE faculty would be encouraged (and welcome) to continue to serve on dissertation committees for projects that require specialized knowledge of particular research methodologies. CoE enrolments would not decrease markedly as a result of this change, and may in fact increase slightly as a larger proportion of the overall doctoral numbers choose the Ph.D. in preference to the Ed.D.

Budgetary and Staff Implications

The proposal will have minimal impact on existing budgetary and staffing resources. No additional staff will be needed to service the degree when moved to the School of Music as there already exists a number of professors in music education who will be able to continue their work with students in the Ph.D. program as it currently exists at the University. Faculty in the Department of Curriculum and Instruction (College of Education) will continue to be involved in the servicing of this degree.

Overall, we do not foresee an immediate increase in the number of doctoral students in music education, except that we predict there will eventually be a greater proportion of doctoral students undertaking the Ph.D. than in the past. This is expected to create an even balance between the numbers of students in the Ed.D. and Ph.D. For example, between 1999 and 2005, 10 Ph.D. and 18 Ed.D. students graduated from the University.

The proposal involves no new courses and faculty now on staff will teach existing courses. In addition, no new additional funding will be required for the library beyond the allocations that are currently available.

Guidelines for Graduate Education

See appendix C

Clearances (letters from other departments)

Letters indicating support for the proposal are listed in the attachments to this proposal, as follows:

Director, School of Music

Dean, College of Fine and Applied Arts

Dean, College of Education

Head, Department of Curriculum and Instruction (CoE)

Provost

Senate

Statement for Programs of Study Catalogue

Doctor of Philosophy in Music Education

The Ph.D. program in music education requires 64 semester hours of credit beyond the master's degree. The School of Music requires a residence period beyond the master's, which must include two successive non-summer semesters of full-time study on the Urbana-Champaign campus. Acceptance of credit earned elsewhere does not reduce the Graduate College academic residence requirement.

Candidates who have not completed a thesis as part of their master's degree will be required to complete an early research requirement during the first year of their program. To satisfy this requirement candidates must enrol in a maximum of 4 semester hours of Independent Study and complete an approved research assignment under the guidance of one or more faculty members.

Research Methodology Requirement: Candidates are required to demonstrate competence in one or several research methodology areas by completing at least 16 semester hours offered by the College of Education. These 16 semester hours are taken in addition to the minimum of 64 semester hours of credit beyond the master's degree. With the approval of the Graduate Coordinator for Music Education, candidates may include MUS 534 Research in Music Education and/or other non-College of Education courses in research methodology. Requirements for all research methodology areas are available on the website and in the Student Academic Affairs office of the College of Education.

Qualifying Examinations: Near the end of the coursework and before admission to the oral preliminary examination, a Ph.D. candidate must complete written qualifying examinations in music education. Each portion of the examination is read and evaluated separately by at least three readers. All readers must judge all parts of the examination as competent doctoral work.

Thesis: A Ph.D. candidate must complete and defend a thesis in accordance with the general requirements of the Graduate College.

Effective Date

Upon approval.

CLEARANCES:

Joe Grant Chair, Music Educ. Gary McPherson Grad Co. Ordinate 2/9/06
Head/chair of the sponsoring department or unit Date

Eve Harwood 10/2/06
Dean of the college of the sponsoring department or unit Date

Dean of the Graduate College Date

Chair, Senate Educational Policy Committee Date

Rew. 11/13/06

Appendix A

Academic Structure of the Ph.D. and Ed.D.

The proposal involves a change of administration rather than academic content, except for the strengthening of the Ph.D. to involve a minimum of 16 semester hours of credit for the thesis (as compared to the current minimum of 4 hours). This minor change, along with the differing expectations, will clearly differentiate the Ph.D. from the Ed.D. The following table outlines the proposed requirements for both the Ph.D. and Ed.D. in music education

| | Dept. C&I | School of Music | |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------|
| | <i>Current Ph.D.</i> | <i>Proposed Ph.D.</i> | Ed.D. |
| | (minimum) 16 hrs | (minimum) 16 hrs | (minimum) 16 hrs |
| Major Subject | 16 hrs | 16 hrs | 16 hrs |
| Education | 16 hrs | 16 hrs | 16 hrs |
| * Research Methodology | 16 hrs | 16 hrs | |
| Research | | | 8 hrs |
| Early research project | Dissertation Pilot | Dissertation Pilot | |
| Thesis | 4-32 hrs | 16 hrs | 8 hrs |
| Minimum Degree Hours | 64 hrs | 64 hrs | 64 hrs |

* In line with current College of Education requirements, the PhD Research Methodology courses are taken in addition to the 64 semester hours of credit beyond the master's degree.

NB: All semester hours in the above table are minimum hours for each category.

Appendix B

PhDs in Music Education Offered by Peer Institutions

Indiana University

DME

Also PhD in music education, theory, or musicology, "conferred by the IU Graduate School"

University of Iowa

PhD in Music Education conferred by the Graduate College in conjunction with the School of Music

University of Michigan

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Michigan State

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

University of Minnesota

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Northwestern

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Ohio State

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Penn State

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

University of Wisconsin – Madison

PhD in Education (Music) offered by Department of Curriculum and Instruction

University of Texas

PhD in Music and Human Learning (School of Music)

University of Florida

PhD in Music Education (School of Music)

University of North Carolina at Greensboro

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

University of Kansas

PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music
University of Colorado at Boulder
PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Case Western Reserve University
PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

University of Oregon
PhD in Music Education offered by the School of Music

Appendix C

DOCTORAL PROGRAMS IN MUSIC EDUCATION

Ph.D. and Ed.D.

The doctoral programs in Music Education are flexibly designed to meet the varying needs and interests of individuals seeking a terminal degree in Music Education. The **Ph.D.** and **Ed.D.** are offered by the School of Music. Both are appropriate for those whose professional goals are aligned with the processes of teaching and learning music, broadly defined, either in public schools, community programs or at the university level. The **Ph.D.** places a greater emphasis on research as compared to the **Ed.D.**, which is oriented toward teacher education. Students elect either the **Ph.D.** or the **Ed.D.** upon entry to the program but are able to transfer from one to the other with the approval of the Division Chair in Music Education.

Application Procedures for Ph.D. and Ed.D.

Initial admission to both the **Ph.D.** and **Ed.D.** require that all materials must be filed no later than January 1 for the subsequent Summer or Fall terms. All materials listed below must be sent to:

Office of Graduate Studies
School of Music
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
1114 West Nevada Street
Urbana, IL 61801

1. **On-Line Application:** Graduate applicants are encouraged to apply online. This document may be accessed at: www.grad.uiuc.edu/prosstudGC.

Applying online offers the following advantages:

- ☐ 7-14 day processing time;
- ☐ Payment by credit card allows the School of Music immediate access to your application;
- ☐ Application status messages may be sent to you from the School of Music.

If you apply online, DO NOT send a paper application; this is unnecessary and may delay the process.

OR, if you choose not to apply on line;

Complete the form titled *Combined Application for Admission or Readmission to the Graduate College and Application for Graduate Appointment*. Mail the form with the application fee. **Your application cannot be processed without receipt of the application fee.**

2. Transcripts of all previous college work must be forwarded by the institution to the address given above.
3. Three recommendations (forms are enclosed with application materials) must be sent to the Office of Graduate Studies as described below:
 - a. recommendation from an individual who can speak to the applicant's teaching accomplishments;
 - b. recommendation from an individual who can speak to the applicant's ability to undertake advanced study;

- c. recommendation from an individual who can speak to the applicant's musicianship as well as to any of the criteria stated above.
- 4. Applicants must hold one degree in Music Education (Bachelor's or Master's) from an accredited institution that led to certification granted by a state board of education. International students' qualifications will be assessed individually to determine the extent to which their credentials are appropriate for music education in their home country.
- 5. Interviews with the Graduate Coordinator for Music Education and the faculty member responsible for the applicant's concentration area are required of all applicants. To be considered for an assistantship, an on-campus interview is required. The interview dealing with knowledge of issues, concepts and trends in music education (see 6. a. below) should also be taken on the day of the interview on campus.
- 6. Successful completion of the **Music Education Entrance Examinations** is required of all applicants. These examinations consist of two parts:
 - a. **Knowledge of issues, concepts and trends in music education**
Bring to your interview three papers you have written in your bachelor or masters degree coursework that demonstrate your ability to think critically and reflectively about an important issue, concept or trend in music education. During the interview, you will be asked to discuss your approach to these three papers, your knowledge of the broader issues related to the topic, and to reflect critically on the various factors which have impacted on your particular view. The aim of this component of the entrance requirements is for you to demonstrate that you are knowledgeable about current issues, concepts and trends in music education, that you have read widely in the discipline, that you are open to new ideas and ways of thinking, and that you will eventually be capable of writing a thesis that will add something fresh to the literature in music education. For this reason, think carefully about the range of topics you choose to discuss and how your ideas have been shaped by major researchers and theorists who have worked in the area. (NB: If you have completed a thesis or research project as part of your master's degree, then this should serve as at least one of the discussion topics).
 - b. **Research Practices**
Questions include identification and definition of basic research terms, identification of prominent music education researchers, and knowledge of major music education research journals and their editors. Applicants not receiving an acceptable score will be required to enrol in MUS 533 (Introduction to Research in Music Education) as a deficiency.

Additional requirement for entry into the Ph.D.

- 7. Completion of a Master's Thesis or Research Project from an accredited institution, or evidence of sufficient background to undertake a major research study (e.g., a substantial article, essay or semester paper). Applicants who are not able to provide this evidence are advised to apply for the Ed.D. and to consider transferring into the Ph.D. once they are able to demonstrate that they are capable of completing a major research project.

Additional requirements for entry into the Ed.D.

- 8. Demonstrated completion of a minimum of three consecutive years of full-time teaching at one institution (five years preferred) as a certified music teacher of children between the ages of three and eighteen.

9. Videotape of a classroom or rehearsal teaching situation and a written explanation of the teaching context and goals. Submission of the videotape and written material is a required component of the initial acceptance procedure.
10. Videotape or DVD of musical performance. Applicants are required to prepare three compositions (or movements of larger works) drawn from three different historical periods, styles or cultures. Two of the selections must represent Western musical traditions. Each of the works should be approximately 4-6 minutes in length. A written list of representative repertoire studied in the past must also be submitted. NOTE: The Division of Music Education recognizes that many teachers have not continued to study or perform regularly. Be assured that our primary concern is that you can demonstrate musicality and basic musicianship to serve as an appropriate musical model for students.

First Year Review for both the Ph.D. and Ed.D.

Upon completion of the first year of study or equivalent, the faculty will conduct a review of the candidate's performance in the following areas: grades in required and elective courses; progress toward completing the early research project (Ph.D. only); evaluation of on-campus teaching (including ICES forms and artifacts of student work, if applicable); and, professional disposition and collegiality.

Qualifying Examinations Requirement

Upon satisfactory completion of approximately 40 hours of graduate level course work, (including MUS 534, 535, and 536) the student can proceed to the Qualifying Examinations. **The purpose of these examinations is to assess the student's ability to synthesize knowledge acquired in coursework taken throughout the doctoral program with emphasis on education and music education philosophy and psychology, research methodology, and music courses.** The Qualifying Examinations are regularly scheduled during the academic year for the third week of October and the second week of March. The Qualifying Examinations can also be scheduled during the Summer Term with the permission of the Examination Chair and Committee. **It is the student's responsibility to select a chair and form the committee for the Qualifying Examinations.** The student should select a faculty member to write questions in the areas of Philosophical Foundations, Psychological Foundations, Research, and Music. These will typically be the faculty members who taught the respective courses, with the student's academic advisor acting as chair. When the student has successfully completed the Qualifying Examinations, he or she can begin working with a dissertation advisor in preparation for the Preliminary Examination.

Preliminary Examination

Students in the **Ph.D.** program schedule the Preliminary Examination after the successful completion of an Early Research Project or submission of an acceptable master's thesis and the preparation of a dissertation proposal. Committee membership will be the same as detailed for the Ed. D. degree. Upon approval of the proposal by the Preliminary Examination Committee the student is admitted to candidacy for the Ph.D. in Music Education.

Students in the **Ed.D. program** schedule the Preliminary Examination after preparation of a dissertation proposal. As with the Qualifying Examinations, **it is the student's responsibility to select a chair and form the committee for the**

Preliminary Examination. This Committee consists of at least four members, two of whom must be tenured. The Chair and at least one committee member must be members of the faculty of the Division of Music Education. Upon approval of the proposal by the Committee the student is admitted to candidacy for the Ed.D. degree. Possible results of the Preliminary Examination are:

- a. **Pass.** The candidate may proceed to independent dissertation research.
- b. **Fail.** The committee may or may not offer the option to retake a portion or all of the examination.
- c. **Decision Deferred.** The committee is in temporary adjournment until a date to be selected (maximum of six months).

The Preliminary Examination cannot be scheduled for the first two weeks of a semester, during the Qualifying Examinations period, or during the final examination period at the conclusion of each semester. Preliminary Committee members must receive the dissertation proposal at least two weeks prior to the scheduled examination.

Final Oral Examination

Upon completion of the dissertation, the candidate must successfully complete a Final Oral Exam covering the contents of the document. This final examination will be chaired by the candidate's dissertation advisor and include members of the Preliminary Examination Committee. Committee members must receive the document at least 2 weeks prior to the scheduled examination. Subsequent to the examination, the candidate will submit the document to the Music Graduate Office for format approval and final check.

Possible results of the Final Examination are:

- a. **Pass; Thesis Satisfactory.** The student submits the final copy of the dissertation. (Directions for depositing the dissertation should be checked thoroughly with the Graduate College Thesis Office, 218 Coble Hall.)
- b. **Pass; Thesis Satisfactory, Pending Revision.** The committee requires the incorporation of specified revisions in the text. When this has been done to the satisfaction of the Committee Chair (or, if the committee so specifies, to the satisfaction of each member of the committee), the student may proceed as above.
- c. **Decision Deferred.** The committee requires major revisions of the thesis followed by a second oral exam. The committee specifies in writing the nature of the requirements to be met. The adjourned exam must be held within six months.
- d. **Fail; Thesis Unsatisfactory.** The committee may or may not offer the option to take another exam.

The Program: Ph.D. in Music Education

This degree is administered by the School of Music. A professor in the Division of Music Education must serve as the academic advisor and dissertation chair. Requirements are listed below. Explanations for each area may be found under the discussion of the Ed.D. Program. **Note: This degree requires the completion of 64 hours**, including satisfactory completion of 16 hours of Research Methodology offered by the College of Education.

Music Education

16 hrs

Required Courses for Ph.D.

10 hrs

MUS 535: Foundations and Principles of Music Education I.

4 hrs

MUS 536: Foundations and Principles of Music Education II.

4 hrs

MUS 544: Doctoral Seminar

2 hrs

Students are required to attend every semester while in residence and enrol once for 2 hours.

Electives: Courses in Music Education – 6 hours

Education

16 hrs

Educational Psychology

8 hours

Educational Policy Studies

8 hours

Research Methodology

16 hrs

Students in the Ph.D. program must file a plan for their **Research**

Methodology no later than the end of their first year of enrolment. The

research courses listed in the Ed.D. may be included as part of this plan.

Other courses should be in a specific area of research methodology, dependent

upon the student's research interests. Students who have not completed a

thesis as part of their master's degree may enroll in a maximum of 4 hours of

Independent Study with their advisor to complete their Early Research Project

(ERP). This unit may be counted as part of the *ERP* requirements.

Thesis (Dissertation) Research

16-32 hrs

The Program: Ed. D. in Music Education

The Ed.D. in Music Education requires the completion of a minimum of 64 hours. It is flexibly designed to meet individual interests. While areas of study are designated, in most cases the student may choose from a wide variety of courses to meet these area requirements.

Music Education **16 hrs**

Required Courses for Ed.D.

MUS 535: Foundations and Principles of Music Education I. 4 hrs

MUS 536: Foundations and Principles of Music Education II. 4 hrs

MUS 544: Doctoral Seminar 2 hrs

(Students are required to attend every semester while in residence and enrol once for 2 hours)

Electives **6 hrs**

Courses may be chosen from:

- **Administration and Supervision of Music Programs**
- **Choral Music Education**
- **General Music Education**
- **Instrumental Music Education**
- **Technology-Based Music Instruction**

Education

16 hrs

Courses to meet this requirement must be selected from two areas. At least one course in each area must be at the 500 level:

Educational Psychology -

8 hrs

One may be selected from the approved Music Education courses:
Music 543: Tests and Measurements in Music Education;

OR

Music 531: Psychology of Music

Educational Policy Studies -

8 hrs

One may be selected from the approved Music Education courses:
Music 537: Administration and Supervision of Music Education

OR

Music 539 Music in Higher Education

Research

8 hrs

Music 534: Research in Music Education

4 hrs

A second course in research methodology (approved in advance by the advisor and the Chair of the Division of Music Education)

4 hrs

Thesis

8 hrs

Music 599: Thesis/Dissertation Research
required

8 hrs

(16 hrs maximum may be counted)

(A Professor in the Division of Music Education must serve as dissertation chair)